BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03351 6717

LAW'S RESPONSE TO POVERTY

Social Work JSL 4419H
Law 367S

VOLUME II

Professor Janet E. Mosher

September, 1991

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Law and Social Work, University of Toronto. They may not be reproduced or circulated for any other purpose.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 24 1991

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

LAW'S RESPONSE TO POVERTY

Social Work JSL 4419H
Law 367S

VOLUME II

Professor Janet E. Mosher

September, 1991

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Law and Social Work, University of Toronto. They may not be reproduced or circulated for any other purpose.

Printed on
Recycled Paper

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/lawsresponsetopo02mosh

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume I

Chapter One -- The Demographics of Poverty

(a) The "Discovery of Poverty

B. Ehrenreich, Fear of Falling, The Inner Life of the Middle Class (New York: Pantheon Books, 1989) 1

(b) Definitions

D.P.Ross and R.Shillington, The Canadian Fact Book On Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Council of Social Development, 1989) 10

J.Hathaway, "Poverty Law and Equality Rights", (1985) 1 Journal of Law and Social Policy 1 19

R. Sidel, Women and Children Last (New York: Penguin, 1987) 21

N. Fraser, "Talking about Needs: Interpretive Contests as Political Conflicts in Welfare-State Societies", [1989] Ethics 291 22

(c) Distribution of Poverty

D.P.Ross and R.Shillington, The Canadian Fact Book On Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Council of Social Development, 1989) 32

(i) Children and Poverty
National Council of Welfare, Poverty Profile 37

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 38

Globe and Mail 42

(ii) Women and Poverty
M.Gunderson and L.Muszynski, Women and Labour Market Poverty (Ottawa:Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women, 1990) 43

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 53

(iii) Working Poor
D.P.Ross and R.Shillington, The Canadian Fact Book On Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Council of Social Development, 1989) 54

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 58

(iv) Native People

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 59

R.Powless, "Native People and Employment: A National Tragedy" (1987) 4 Current, Readings in Race Relations 2 61

"Economic Issues Facing Native Women in Ontario" (1987) 4 Current, Readings in Race Relations 6 65

(d) Dimensions of Inequality

D.Greschner, "Dimensions of Inequality" 68

G.York, The Dispossessed (London, Vintage, 1990) 69

L.Rubin, Worlds of Pain, Life in the Working-Class Family (New York: Basic Books, 1976) 80

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 94

B.Nelson, "Women's Poverty and Women's Citizenship", [1984] Signs 209 96

Globe and Mail, December 12, 1990 97

Globe and Mail, July 25, 1989 98

Chapter Two -- Understanding the Roots of Poverty

(a) Introduction

M.Morris and J.Williamson, Poverty and Public Policy, (New York: Greenwood Press, 1986) 99

Economic Council of Canada, Good Jobs, Bad Jobs (Ottawa: Ministry of Supply and Services, Canada, 1990) 110

(b) Race

F.Henry and E.Ginzberg, "Racial Discrimination in Employment", in Curtis et al (ed), Social Inequality in Canada (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall, 1988) 120

Globe and Mail, January 21, 1991 127

Globe and Mail, February 1, 1991 128

J.Reitz, "Ethnic Concentrations in Labour Markets and Their Implications for Ethnic Inequality", in Breton et al (ed), Ethnic Identity and Equality) Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990) 129

A.Irving, "From No Poor Law to the Social Assistance Review: A History of Social Assistance in Ontario, 1791-1987, Background paper for the Social Assistance Review Committee, July, 1987 140

(c) Gender

S.Moller Okin, "Gender, the Public and the Private", University of Toronto Legal Theory Workshop, October 18, 1989 141

(d) Gender, Race, Class

F.Henry and T.Rees, "Feminism, Racism and Class" (1983-4) 1 Currents, Readings in Race Relations 177

R.Ng, "The Social Construction of 'Immigrant Women' in Canada". in Hamilton et al (ed), The Politics of Diversity (Montreal: Book Center Inc., 1987) 180

"Immigrant and Visible Minority Women in Ontario: Barriers to Employment" (1987) 4 Currents,Readings in Race Relations 16 190

R.Coles and J.H.Coles, Women of Crisis (Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, 1989) 194

Chapter Three -- The Welfare State

(a) Historical Underpinnings of Canada's Welfare State

D.Guest, The Emergence of Social Security in Canada (2d ed.) (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, !985) 213

A.Finkel, "Origins of the Welfare State in Canada, in L.Panitch (ed.). The Canadian State (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1977) 222

L.Pal, "Federalism, Social Policy and the Constitution", in Ismael, J.(ed) Canadian Social Welfare Policy (Kingston: McGill-Queen's Press, 1985) 233

(b) Theories of the Welfare State

G.Goodin, Reasons for Welfare (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988) 234

F.Piven and C.Cloward, Regulating the Poor:The Function of Public Welfare (New York: Pantheon Books, 1971) 240

M.Walzer, "Welfare, Membership and Need", in Sandel (ed) Liberalism and its Critics (New York: New York University Press, 1984) 260

(c) The Canadian Welfare State

National Council of Welfare, "Fighting Poverty: The Effect of Government Policy", in D.Drache and D.Cameron (eds), The Other MacDonald Report (Toronto, James Lorimer & Company, 1985) 269

R.Melchers, "The Cap on Cap" (1990) 14 Perception 19 278

Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan, Supreme Court of Canada, August, 1991 283

(d) Failings of Canada's Income Security Programs

G.Riches,"Feeding Canada's Poor", in J.Ismael (ed), The Canadian Welfare State, Evolution and Transition (Edmonton:University of Alberta Press, 1987) 299

R.Henderson, "Banking on a Better Future", (1989) 13 Perception 8 310

Globe and Mail Articles 313

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 316

R.Scott, "Living and Dying on the Street: How the Social Service System Failed Drina Joubert", Just Cause 16 318

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision E-05-14-03R 321

Chapter 4 -- The Social Assistance System

(a) A Description

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 325

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 331

MCSS Fact Sheets 340

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 347

Globe and Mail, December 19, 1990 358

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 359

MCSS Fact Sheet 360

(b) Access

R.Doyle and L.Visano, "Equality and Multiculturalism: Access to Community Services", (1988) 3 Journal of Law and Social Policy 371

(c) First Nations

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 378

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 384

MCSS Fact Sheet 386

(d) Recipients' Experiences

Ben Carniol, Case Critical (2d)(Toronto: Between the Lines, 1990) 388

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 395

Chapter 5 -- Employment

(a) The Place of Employment in the Welfare State

D.Moon, "The Moral Basis of the Welfare State", in A.Gutmann (ed) Democracy and the Welfare State (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988) 399

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 413

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision J-08-07-03 417

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-06-22-02 421

Kerr v. Toronto General Manager, Department of Social Services, unreported decision, Ontario Divisional Court, June 13, 1991 423

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision G-08-03-04 431

Globe and Mail, January 5, 1991 433

(b) Societal Obligations -- Workfare, Learnfare?

P.Rochman, "Working for Welfare: A Response to the Social Assistance Review Committee", (1989) 5 Journal of Law and Social Policy 198 434

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 442

Globe and Mail 454

ERN, "Job Training for People on Social Assistance", Fall 1990 455

MCSS Fact Sheet 457

T.Corbett et al., "Learnfare: The Wisconsin Experience", (1989) 12 Focus 1. 458

Re Howell and Director of Family Benefits (1986) 56 O.R. (2d)773 464

(c) Removing Barriers to Employment

MCSS Fact Sheet 467

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-10-24-05 471

MCSS Fact Sheet 479

C.Pateman, "The Patriarchal Welfare State", in A.Gutmann (ed) Democracy and the Welfare State (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988 484

Chapter 6 -- "The Family"; Public v. Private Support

(a) Defining "the family"

M.Barrett and M.MacIntosh, The Anti-Social Family (London: Verso Editions, 1982) 499

M.Leighton, "Handmaids' Tales: Family Benefits Assistance and the Single-Mother-Led Family", (1987) 45 Univ. Toronto Fac. L. Rev. 324 515

Re Burton and Minister of Community and Social Services (1985) 52 O.R. (2d) 211 (Ont. Div. Ct.) 520

Re Warwick v. Minister of Community and Social Services (1978) 5R.F.L. (2d) 325 (Ont.C.A.) 526

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision G-09-02-14 531

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-02-16-18 536

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-04-18-09 543

McInnis v. Crowell (1989) 92 N.S.R. 254 (N.S.S.C.) 553

D.Herman, "Are We Family?: Lesbian Rights and Women's Liberation" (1990) 28 Osgoode Hall Law Journal 789 555

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 561

(b) Public v. Private Support

F.Steel, "The Role of the State in the Enforcement of Maintenance", in Women, the Law and the Economy 562

Campbell v. Director, Income Maintenance Branch (1990) 71 D.L.R.(4th) 766 (Ont.Div.Ct.) 568

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision J-03-04-20 570

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 578

J.Fudge, "The Privatization of the Costs of Social Reproduction: Sine Recent Charter Cases", (1989) 3 Canadian Journal of Women and the Law 246 582

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 586

J.Lewis, "Feminism and Welfare", in J.Mitchell et al (ed) What is Feminism? (New York) Pantheon Books, 1986) 587

Chapter 7 -- Welfare Adminstration and Procedural Fairness

(a) Bureaucracy

K.Fergusion, The Feminist Case Against Bureaucracy (Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press, 1984) 595

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 622

H.Wasserman, "The Professional Social Worker in a Bureaucracy", [1971] Social Work 89 623

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 628

G.Frug, "The Ideology of Bureaucracy in American Law", (1984) 97 Harvard Law Review 1276 631

(b) The Due Process Response

C.Reich, "Individual Rights and Social Welfare: The Emerging Legal Issues", (1965) 74 Yale Law Journal 1245 633

Goldberg v. Kelly (1970) 397 U.S.254 638

(c) The Social Assistance Review Board -- an Internal Critique of Procedural Fairness

J.Leatch, "Procedural Fairness in the Social Assistance System", Background paper for the Social Assistance Review Committee, August, 1987 648

Re Cardinal and Director of Family Benefits (1981), 32 O.R.(2d) 65 (Ont. Div. Ct.) 683

Social Assistance Review Board, 1989-90 Annual Report 686

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 694

MCSS Fact Sheet 698

I.Morrison, "Security of the Person and the Person in Need: Section Seven of the Charter and the Right to Welfare", Journal of Law and Social Policy 700

Re Singh and Minister of Employment and Immigration (1985), 17 D.L.R. (4th) 422 (SCC) 717

(d) The External Critique of Procedural Fairness and "Liberal Legalism"

J.Handler, The Conditions of Discretion (New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1986) 725

Re Gray and Director, Income Maintenance Branch (1985), 50 O.R. (2d) 657 (Ont.Div. Ct.) 754

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-11-22-06 756

Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-03-21-05 759

W.Simon, "Legality, Bureaucracy, and Class in the Welfare System", (1983) 92 Yale Law Journal 1198 761

H.Beatty, "Discretionary Decision-Making, Equity and Social Assistance", Background paper for the Social Assistance Review Committee, May, 1987 783

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 816

K.Lawrence, "Systemic Discrimination: Regulation 8 -- Family Benefits Act: Policy of Reasonable Efforts to Obtain Financial Resources", (1990) 6 Journal of Law and Social Policy 57 820

Chapter 8 -- The Rights Debate and Struggles for Social Transformation

(a) The Case Against Rights

M.Tushnet, "An Essay on Rights", (1984) 62 Texas Law Review 1363 827

Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 835

M.Ignatieff, The Needs of Strangers (New York: Viking Press, 1985) 836

Re Phillips and Lynch (1986), 27 D.L.R. (4th) 156 841

Schachter and the Queen (1990) 66 D.L.R. (4th) 635 (Fed.C.A.) 843

Silano v. The Queen in Right of B.C. (1987), 33 C.R.R.331 846

R.Hasson, "What's Your Favourite Right?", (1989) 5 Journal of Law and Social Policy 1 853

(b) The Arguments for Rights

A.Hunt, "Rights and Social Movements: Counter-Hegemonic Strategies", (1990) 17 Journal of Law and Society 309 854

New York Times, Nov 27, 1990, "U.S.Supreme Court Leaves Intact a Ban on Subway Begging" 864

P.Williams, "Alchemical Notes: Reconstructing Ideals from Deconstructed Rights", (1987) 22 Harv. Civ.Rights-Civ. Liberties L.Rev. 401 865

E.Schneider, "The Dialectic of Rights and Politics", (1986) 61 New York Univ. Law. Rev. 589 877

W.Simon, "The Invention and Reinvention of Welfare Rights", (1985) 44 Maryland L.Rev. 1 884

Chapter 9 -- Conceptualizing a Role for Law in Struggles for Social Transformation

A.Sarat, ""...The Law Is All Over": Power, Resistance and the Legal Consciousness of the Welfare Poor", (1990) 2 Yale J. of Law and the Humanities 343 921

J.Hathaway, "Poverty Law and Equality Rights", (1985) 1 J.of Law and Social Policy 1 937

A.Alfieri, "The Antinomies of Poverty Law and a Theory of Dialogic Empowerment", (1986-87) XVI Rev. of Law and Social Change 659 938

L.White, To Learn and Teach: Lessons From Driefontein on Lawyering and Power, [1988] Wisconsin Law Rev 699 945

P.Friere, Pedagogy of the Oppressed (New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1989) 969

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 985

Ben Carniol, Case Critical (2d) (Toronto: Between the Lines, 1990) 990

Appendix

Family Benefits Act R.S.O.1980, c.151 998

General Welfare Assistance Act R.S.O. 1980, c.188 1002

Regulations to the Family Benefits Act 1006
Reg. 318 R.R.O. 1980
Reg. 424/82
Reg. 360/83
Reg. 638/86
Reg. 589/87